JUN 1 6 2021

BEFORE THE WEST VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF REGISTRATION FOR PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERS

WV PE BOARD

IN RE:

CONSULTING ENGINEERING SERVICES, INCORPORATED

C2021-23

CONSENT ORDER

Comes now the West Virginia State Board of Registration for Professional Engineers by Bhajan S. Saluja, P.E., its President, (hereinafter "the Board") for the purpose of agreeing to resolve a Board-initiated Complaint seeking disciplinary action against Consulting Engineering Services, Incorporated ("Respondent Firm"). As reflected in this document, the parties have reached an agreement concerning the proper disposition of this matter, and the Board, upon approval of this agreement, does hereby **FIND** the following:

- The matters set forth herein are within the jurisdiction of the Board, which is the state entity
 with the power and duty to regulate the practice of engineering in the State of West
 Virginia.
- 2. Respondent Firm is a corporation organized under the laws of the State of Connecticut with its principal place of business in Middletown, Connecticut.
- 3. On May 3, 2021, the Board received Respondent Firm's application for a Certificate of Authorization ("COA"). The application proposed that the Registered Engineer in Responsible Charge would be James Senatro. Respondent Firm's COA (COA# C06477) was activated on May 3, 2021.
- 4. The Board received information that Respondent Firm, prior to May 3, 2021, the date it received its COA, had provided engineering services for an engineering project in West Virginia. Specifically, that it had submitted mechanical, electrical and plumbing (MEP) and fire system drawings for a project located in Beaver, Raleigh County, West Virginia, to an existing client. Said drawings were dated February 12, 2021.
- Respondent Firm did not hold an active COA prior to it providing engineering services for this Raleigh County, West Virginia project.

- 6. This resulted in a Board-initiated investigation, which resulted in the allegations set forth in the Complaint that Respondent Firm had practiced engineering in the State of West Virginia without the required COA, and that Respondent Firm aided or assisted another person, who was not duly registered, in providing engineering services in the State of West Virginia.
- 7. The Board initiated Complaint Number C2021-23 at its regular meeting on May18, 2021, which was received and filed by the Board on said date.
- 8. Prior to the thirty-day Response deadline, the Board and Respondent agreed to settle this matter by the entry of a Consent Order in lieu of Respondent filing a formal response to the Complaint, and by waiving its rights to an administrative hearing and to any subsequent appeal.
- 9. By agreement of the parties, Respondent Firm will admit that it practiced engineering in the State of West Virginia without a COA, and that it aided or assisted an unlicensed person to provide engineering services for a West Virginia project when that person did not possess a West Virginia Professional Engineer Registration (a.k.a. "license"). In return for Respondent Firm's admissions, the Board shall proceed solely against the firm in this matter.
- 10. The Board has considered the following factors in reaching this settlement: there was no risk of harm to the public; the violation did not pose any harm to the public; Respondent Firm applied for and received a COA prior to initiation of this Complaint; and Respondent cooperated in the resolution of this Complaint
- 11. The Board, in its discretion, will not assess administrative costs although it is within its power to assess such costs and administrative costs were incurred in the investigation, initiation and resolution of this complaint.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 12. The Board is the state entity with the power and duty to regulate the practice of engineering in the State of West Virginia, and matters related to such practice are within the jurisdiction of the Board. W. Va. Code §30-13-1 et seq.
- 13. James Senatro, as Vice-President of Respondent Firm, has the power and authority to make admissions and otherwise act on behalf of Respondent Firm, and he makes such admissions, knowingly, freely, voluntarily, and without any threat of harm or act of coercion.
- 14. Failure to comply with any of the provisions of W. Va. Code §30-13-1 et seq., or any of the rules promulgated under West Virginia Code Chapter 30, Article 13, is a basis for disciplinary action by the Board. W. Va. Code §30-13-21(a)(4).
- 15. The Board is authorized to "assess civil penalties against any person who violates any provision of this article or any rule promulgated by the board for each offense in an amount determined by the board." W. Va. Code §30-13-21(b); see also W. Va. Code §30-13-21(d)(4), and W.Va. Code R. §7-1-15.
- 16. The Board may reprimand, suspend or revoke or refuse to issue, restore or renew a certificate of registration or authorization, or place on probation, impose a civil penalty or reprimand any professional engineer or firm, who has failed to comply with any of the provisions of this article or any of the rules promulgated under it. W. Va. Code §30-13-21(a)(4), (b) and (d), and §30-13-22(d).
- 17. It is unlawful for any firm to practice or offer to practice engineering, as defined by West Virginia Code §30-13-3(e), in the State of West Virginia unless that firm has obtained a COA under the provisions of West Virginia engineering law. W. Va. Code §30-13-17.
- 18. Practicing engineering, or offering to practice engineering as defined by W. Va. Code §30 13-3(e), without an active COA is an action that may subject a firm to discipline by the Board, including a civil penalty up to Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00) for each offense. W.Va. Code R. §7-1-15.1.

- 19. It is unlawful for any person to practice or offer to practice engineering, as defined by West Virginia Code §30-13-3(e), in the State of West Virginia unless that person is duly registered under the provisions of West Virginia engineering law. W.V. Code §30-13-2.
- 20. Practicing engineering, or offering to practice engineering, as defined by W. Va. Code §30-13-3(e), without a license is an action that may subject a person to discipline by the Board, including a civil penalty up to Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00). W. Va. Code R. §7-1-15.1.
- 21. It is unlawful for any person to aid or assist the unlicensed offer of engineering services, and/or the unlicensed practice of engineering. W. Va. Code §30-13-21(a)(8) and W. Va. Code §30-13-2.
- 22. The penalty for aiding and assisting a violation of engineering law and its rules shall be no more than the maximum penalty set forth in the Board rule, W.Va. Code R. §7-1-15.1. W.Va. Code R. §7-1-15.2. A person, so aiding or assisting, shall be disciplined in the same manner and extent as the actor committing the offense. In this case, the underlying violation is practicing engineering, as defined by W. Va. Code §30-13-3(e), without a license. Such action subjects a person to discipline by the Board, including a civil penalty up to Five Thousand Dollars (\$5,000.00). W. Va. Code R. §7-1-15.1.
- 23. The provisions of W. Va. Code §30-13-21(a) are applicable to persons and firms. W. Va. Code §30-13-21(b) and (d).
- 24. Based on the findings of fact set forth above, and the legal citations set forth herein, Respondent Firm violated W. Va. Code §30-13-17 for one count of providing engineering services in West Virginia without the required COA, and W.Va. Code §30-13-21(a)(8) for one count of aiding or assisting another person in violating West Virginia Code §30-13-1 et seq. and the promulgated rules of the Board.
- 25. In determining the amount of a civil penalty to be assessed, the Board may consider such factors as the circumstances leading to the violation; the nature and severity of the violation and the risk of harm to the public; the extent to which the cited person or firm has

- cooperated with the Board and the Board's investigation; and other matters as may be appropriate. W. Va. Code R. §7-1-15.4.
- 26. The assessment of administrative costs is within the Board's sole discretion. W. Va. Code §30-13-21(d)(4) and W. Va. Code R. §7-1-14.4.

CONSENT OF THE RESPONDENT

James Senatro, as Vice-President of Respondent Firm, by affixing his signature hereon, agrees to the following on behalf of Respondent Firm, Consulting Engineering Services, Incorporated:

- 27. Respondent acknowledges its right to consult an attorney of their choosing, at its sole expense, and it knowingly, freely, voluntarily, and without any threat of harm or act of coercion waives its right to proceed with counsel, and will proceed pro se. Further, Respondent is aware of its rights to pursue this matter through appropriate administrative and/or court proceedings, including its right to a formal hearing before the Board, and Respondent knowingly, freely and voluntarily waives these rights provided the Board accepts the terms and conditions set forth in this Consent Order.
- 28. Respondent Firm admits it did not have a Certificate of Authorization to practice engineering in the State of West Virginia at the time it provided engineering services in West Virginia, in violation of West Virginia engineering law, and it further admits it aided and/or assisted another person in violating West Virginia engineering law, W. Va. Code §30-13-1 et seq. and/or the rules promulgated under it.
- 29. Respondent accepts the findings set forth above and consents to the entry of this Consent Order knowingly, freely and voluntarily, and not under duress, restraint or compulsion.
- 30. If the Board does reject this proposal, any admissions made by Respondent Firm herein are deemed null and void.
- 31. Respondent acknowledges that this Consent Order is being executed for the purpose of avoiding further administrative action with respect to the above-styled matter. In this

- regard, Respondent authorizes the Board to review and examine all investigative file materials concerning Respondent Firm's activities in West Virginia in consideration of this Consent Order.
- 32. Should the Board not approve this Consent Order, Respondent waives any objections to the Board or any of its members participating in the adjudication of this matter. This paragraph is binding on Respondent even if the Board does not approve this Consent Order.
- 33. Respondent acknowledges that the Board may reject this proposal, notice and hold a hearing, and, upon adjudication, impose such sanctions of a disciplinary nature as it deems appropriate.
- 34. Respondent understands that this Consent Order constitutes a full and final settlement of this matter, and nothing in this Consent Order or the circumstances giving rise to the same may be the subject of any appeal or other civil or administrative actions except an action by the Board to enforce the terms of this Consent Order, but that nothing in this Consent Order prohibits the Board from considering this disciplinary action or the circumstances giving rise to same with regard to any future disciplinary matter involving Respondent which may be before this Board.
- 35. Respondent understands that the Complaint and this Consent Order are public records which, together with other public documents in the file, must be made available upon legal request in accordance with the State's Freedom of Information Act.
- 36. Respondent agrees that the sum and substance of the Complaint and this agreement in part or in their entirety will be set forth in Board publications and on the Board's website, as well as other appropriate placements, including the non-public enforcement exchange database administered by the National Council of Examiners for Engineering and Surveying (NCEES).
- 37. Respondent acknowledges that non-compliance with this Consent Order may result in the rescission of this agreement, the reinstatement of the Complaint, the summary revocation, non-renewal or non-reinstatement of any Certificate of Authorization issued to Respondent

- Firm by the Board, and the addition of any other charges which may arise or ensue from Respondent Firm's non-compliance with this Consent Order.
- 38. Respondent Firm acknowledges that proof of any material misstatement or misrepresentation made in connection with this matter will result in the rescission of this agreement, the reinstatement of the Complaint, the summary revocation, non-renewal or non-reinstatement of any Certificate of Authorization issued to Respondent Firm by the Board, and the addition of any other charges which may arise or ensue from providing false information to the Board in violation of West Virginia engineering law.

ORDER

- On the basis of the foregoing, and upon entry of this Consent Order, the Board hereby ORDERS that this Consent Order shall serve as settlement of Complaint Number C2021-23 pursuant to West Virginia Code § 30-13-22(b).
- 2. The Board **ORDERS** Respondent Firm to pay a civil penalty in the amount of Two Hundred Fifty Dollars (\$250.00) for practicing engineering without a Certificate of Authorization.
- 3. The Board ORDERS Respondent Firm to pay a civil penalty in the amount of Two Hundred Fifty Dollars (\$250.00) for aiding or assisting the practice of engineering in West Virginia without a license.
- 4. The civil penalty imposed herein totaling Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00) must be paid within thirty (30) days of the date of entry set forth below, such amount to be made payable to the "W. Va. P.E. Board" for transfer to the general fund of the State of West Virginia upon receipt.
- 5. The sum and substance of the Complaint and this agreement in part or in their entirety shall be set forth in Board publications and on the Board's website, as well as other appropriate placements, including the non-public enforcement exchange database administered by the National Council of Examiners for Engineering and Surveying (NCEES).

- 6. Any violation of the terms of this Consent Order shall be immediate cause for rescission of this Consent Order, reinstatement of the Complaint, the summary revocation of the COA issued to Respondent Firm by the Board, and further disciplinary action by the Board.
- 7. If the civil penalty imposed herein is not paid within thirty (30) days of the date of entry set forth below, then Respondent Firm's COA is hereby **ORDERED REVOKED**. Said revoked COA may be restored once the civil penalty is paid, and Respondent Firm pays the appropriate fees, and is otherwise in good standing with the Board. West Virginia Code §30-13-21(d)(1).
- 8. This Consent Order may be summarily enforced in the Circuit Court of Kanawha County, West Virginia, without further notice to Respondent Firm upon application by the Board for the entry of a Judgment Order for the total amount of payment agreed to herein of Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00), together with pre-judgment interest from the date of the Board President's signature hereon, post-judgment interest from the date of entry of the Judgment Order, and all costs of any enforcement action(s), which judgment shall be fully executable in accordance with applicable law.
- 9. This matter shall be closed upon execution of this Consent Order by both parties and the full payment of the civil penalty agreed to herein, except as to the provisions set forth in paragraph 7, above, regarding revocation of Respondent Firm's COA, and its effects shall survive the closure of this Consent Order.
- 10. This Consent Order constitutes a full and final settlement of this matter, and nothing in this Consent Order or the circumstances giving rise to the same may be the subject of any appeal or other civil or administrative actions except an action by the Board to enforce the terms of this Consent Order. This shall not prohibit the Board from considering this disciplinary action or the circumstances giving rise to the same with regard to any future disciplinary matter involving Respondent Firm which may come before this Board.

11. This Consent Order relates solely to matters set forth in West Virginia engineering law and does not evidence compliance with any other laws of the State of West Virginia or its political subdivisions, nor should any such compliance be implied.

AGREED TO BY:

1	1 D X	1
ffry	I. fail	
ø6/ISULTING	G ENGINEERI	ING SERVICES,

INCORPORATED

By: JAMES SENATRO, VICE-PRESIDENT

ENTERED into the records of the West Virginia State Board of Registration for Professional Engineers this 22 day of , 2021.

WEST VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF REGISTRATION FOR PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERS

By:

BOARD PRESIDENT